



**NDA**

National  
Development  
Agency



**MMAMATI WA TSIE**

**CLOSE OUT EVALUATION REPORT**

**NOVEMBER 2013**





Submitted By : INTEGRITY ENVIRONMENTAL SOLUTIONS (PTY) LTD

Date of Evaluation : 14 November 2013

# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## I. Introduction

The Mmamati Wa Tsie Drop-in Centre is a registered Non-Profit Organisation (NPO) established in 2005 by the women from the Ga-Selepe Village, Fetakgomo Local Municipality (Sekhukhune District) in the Limpopo Province. The Centre was set up in order to address the need for a said area for working, unemployed and job seeking parents to leave their pre-school and accommodate primary school children after school.

In spite of the centre having been established as early as 2005, it continued to struggle to sustain itself due to the dependency on fees and donations. According to Statsa 2011 survey, the unemployment rate in this area in excess of 56%.

Total funding to the value of R 1 247 120.00 was granted to Mmamati Wa Tsie Drop-in Centre. The funding was approved for a one year period starting on 1 September 2012 and ending on 31 August 2013.

## II. Objectives

- **Project Objectives:**

- Establishment of a high quality Day Care Centre
- To increase access to Early Childhood Development (ECD) to a larger part of the community.
- Build Capacity for Mmamati staff members.
- Provide balanced meals for the children.
- Train 35 project employees
- Register the Ratanang Crèche with the Department of Social Development (DSD).

- **Evaluation Objective:**

- The National Development Agency (NDA) appointed Integrity Environmental Solutions (Pty) Ltd to conduct a close out evaluation on the Mmamati Drop-in Centre. To date, R 1 122 408.00 (90%) has been released by the NDA towards project execution.
- To provide a comprehensive performance overview of the Mmamati Drop-In Centre Project
- Highlight the lessons learned for NDA so that the conclusions and recommendations arrived at can assist NDA in moving forward and be sustainable
- Highlight the project alignment with municipality IDP's
- Highlight the project alignment with relevant government sector departments 'programmes

- **Specific Objectives:**

The specific objectives of this study in relation to the funding are:

- Relevance: Ability of the project to address the beneficiary direct needs
- Effectiveness: Were the right interventions undertaken?
- Efficiency: How well were the interventions implemented?
- Impact: Did the project have a measurable improvement in the lives of the recipients?
- Sustainability: Can the project sustain itself after the NDA funding has stopped?

A methodology involving triangulation was used to gather and validate data obtained from various sources. Interviews, site visits and document reviews formed part of the methodology. Surveys were excluded in this study as the available sample of people was too small to yield statistically significant and reliable data.

### **III. Successes**

- The construction of new and safe classrooms is complete and the children have already occupied these rooms.
- The Ratanang day care has relocated from the old dilapidated building and is now operating from the Drop-in Centre.
- The small vegetable garden is providing food for the Drop-in centre and some community members
- Employment opportunities were created, i.e., 5 builders, 2 cleaners, 5 gardeners, 6 cooks and 2 teachers

### **IV. Challenges**

- The due diligence contractor has failed in his duty to conduct, as part of the initial detailed feasibility study which identified key project risks and the necessary mitigation upfront.
- Scarce water resources and its impact on the project objectives.
- Geotechnical instability
  - Most building structures in the community are cracked due to the activities at the nearby Bakoni Platinum mine
- The project had too many objectives therefore spreading existing resources widely.
  - Mmamati was not able to achieve the objectives as they were too many and they also lacked capacity
- The inadequate Due Diligence study led to flawed Project design.

### **V. Corrective action**

The scope of the due diligence studies conducted by NDA on projects should be extended to include but not limited to the following analysis:

- Geotechnical studies - Detailed assessment of the soil, feasibility for farming and appropriate building structures to be constructed.
- Water resources - Agricultural water conservation technologies and practices have to be investigated.
- Climate assessment – Rainfall extent, reliability of growing season rainfall, temperature, humidity and solar exposure, likelihood and effect of undesirable weather events (drought, floods, heat waves, frost etc).
- Infrastructure - Detailed assessment of facilities, infrastructure and services needed.
- Location and market access
- Detailed assessment of the organisational capacity should be conducted in order to decide on the deliverable objectives.
- Detailed feasibility study on Early Childhood Development in order to introduce the most effective intervention.

## **VI. Project Recommendations**

While there are control breakdowns and weaknesses, the Mmamati Wa Tsie project team is firmly committed to the cause and objective of poverty eradication initiative by the NDA.

Mmamati has demonstrated the commitment and capability in the Early Childhood Development and it is therefore recommended that the NDA should continue to assist in growing the capacity of the Mmamati in this regard.

However, it is further recommended that funding for the next phase be kept on hold subject to Mmamati supplying the audited financial statements for the 2012 and 2013.

The outstanding Interim financial reports should also be submitted to the NDA accounting on how the grant funding was spent.

Mmamati is fulfilling a fundamental need of education in the Ga-Selepe community and it is IES opinion that Mmamati will best serve the community if it focusses mainly on ECD interventions. The small garden at the centre should be kept in operation in order to provide food to the Drop-in Centre.

It is further recommended that funding for the planned farming activities at the 3hectare stand be discontinued and Mmamati should be encouraged to focus on growing the capacity of the Drop-in Centre.

More educational activities should be introduced at the centre in order to develop the children mental capacity, like:

- Adding computer centre with the internet is but one of the
- Art and Drama classes

- Extra Maths and English Classes
- Sporting activities

The Mmamati 3 hectare stand can be converted into a micro-farming where community members are given a small piece of land to produce vegetables and Mmamati's role in this will be:

- To access markets
- Business linkages to sell fresh produce
- Market research.

## VII. Sustainability

Due to high unemployment, Mmamati Drop-in centre is currently not able to generate income from the school fees as most parents are unemployed. The small vegetable garden produce at the Drop-in Centre is only enough to provide food for the Drop-in Centre. The project can therefore not sustain itself without third party funding.

It is IES opinion that the benefits ECD interventions at Mmamati are of a long term nature and that NDA should continue to support it without expecting it to be sustainable.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES.....	vii
LIST OF FIGURES.....	ix
1 BACKGROUND.....	1
2 EVALUATION, AIMS & OBJECTIVES.....	3
3 EVALUATION METHODOLOGY.....	4
3.1 Documentation and Records.....	4
3.2 Observations (Site Visits and validation Interviews).....	5

3.2.1	NDA Management .....	5
3.2.2	Mmamati Drop-in Centre Management.....	6
4	RESULTS.....	6
4.1	Documents .....	6
4.1.1	Documents and Records Control .....	7
4.2	Compliance to Contractual Terms.....	7
4.2.1	Summary show extent of contract compliance .....	7
4.2.2	Interim Implementation Reports .....	8
4.2.3	Financial Statement.....	8
4.2.4	Monitoring Reports .....	9
4.3	Site Visits (Observation and interview):.....	9
4.3.1	ECD catering for crèche pre-school and Drop in Centre. ....	10
4.3.2	Employment creation .....	12
4.3.3	Provision of food .....	13
4.3.4	Key Community Challenges.....	14
4.3.5	Responses to evaluation question .....	16
4.3.6	Achievement of Overall Pre-specified objectives .....	19
4.3.7	Strength and Weaknesses .....	20
4.4	Population Statistics .....	20
4.4.1	Key Statistics for the Fetakgomo Municipality (2011).....	20
5	DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS .....	21
5.1.1	Key Evaluation Issues.....	21
5.1.2	Generalisation of Results .....	40
5.1.3	Unexpected results and their implications .....	41
6	RECOMMENDATIONS.....	42
7	LESSONS LEARNT.....	43
8	REFERENCES .....	46
9	ANNEXURES.....	48
	Annexure A : Evaluation Questionnaire .....	48
	Annexure B : Mmamati Drop-in Pictures .....	48
	Annexure C : Results from Contract Review .....	50

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Other third Party Funding.....	2
Table 2: Current Scope for which Mmamati Drop-in Centre was awarded funding by NDA .....	3
Table 3: Suppliers of documents and records.....	6
Table 4: Summary of results showing contract compliance (Annexure C) .....	7
Table 5: Project Interim Reports.....	8
Table 6: Summary of the achievement of the overall pre-specified objectives .....	19
Table 7: Strength and Weaknesses.....	20
Table 8: Key Statistic of the Fetakgomo Municipality - Statistics South Africa (StatsSA) 2011. ....	20
Table 9: Planned Project Activities .....	21
Table 10: Capacity building objectives .....	27
Table 11: NDA Funding Objectives .....	29
Table 12: Reporting Objectives .....	29
Table 13: Contract Deviations.....	30
Table 14: Recommendations.....	42
Table 15: Project evaluation Questionnaire .....	48
Table 16: Results detailing the degree to which NDA mandate is met (document review) .....	50
Table 17: Financial Administration by Recipient.....	51
Table 18: Results detailing degree to which recipient is meeting additional obligations? .....	52
Table 19: Results Detailing Procedure for Payment Issues .....	53
Table 20: Result Detailing Issues Relating to Remedies for Non-conformance .....	53
Table 21: Results Detailing Claims against 3rd Parties .....	53

**Table 22: Results detailing Cession issues.....53**  
**Table 23: Results Detailing Force Majeure Issues .....54**

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1 : Old Ratanang Crèche .....	10
Figure 2 : New Mmamati Drop- in Centre Wendy Housing which also accommodates the Ratanang Crèche .....	11
Figure 3 : Male and Female Toilets .....	11
Figure 4 : Fence installed at the Mmamati Drop in Centre.....	12
Figure 5 : Volunteers busy with the construction of a proper kitchen .....	12
Figure 6 : Lunch time at Mmamati Drop in Centre.....	13
Figure 7 : Mmamati Small Vegetable Garden .....	13
Figure 8 : Infertile Monametse Village Land .....	15
Figure 9 : Cracked Infrastructure due to Geotechnical instability .....	15
Figure 10 : Vehicle allocated to Mmamati .....	31
Figure 11 : Brick making production in progress.....	35
Figure 12 : Moringo Plant.....	36
Figure 13 : Side lamp made from egg tray and decorated with beans .....	36
Figure 14 : Hydroponics gardening .....	38
Figure 15 : New Mmamati Drop in Centre Office (Wendy House) .....	48
Figure 16 : Ratanang Crèche.....	49
Figure 17 : Mmamati Drop-In Centre .....	49
Figure 18 : Preparation for Septic tank .....	49
Figure 19 : Temporary cooking place .....	50
Figure 20 : Volunteers – Builders, cooks, teachers and garden staff.....	Error! Bookmark not defined.

## **1 BACKGROUND**

The National Development Agency (NDA) is a statutory organisation established under Act of Parliament (NDA Act 108 of 1998). NDA's primary objective is to eradicate poverty. NDA effects this by investing in a number of community developmental interventions that require financial input and support.

Total funding to the value of R 1 330 740.00 was awarded to Mmamati Wa Tsie Drop-in Centre, hereafter referred to as Mmamati, for the period 01 September 2012 to 31 August 2013. Two months after the expiry of this contract, the NDA appointed Integrity Environmental Solution (IES) to conduct a Close out Evaluation of the Project.

The backbone of the terms of engagement is the funding agreement. The funding agreement is the "promise" document by Mmamati (Recipient) to the NDA (donor) as to the outcomes that the applicant would achieve if granted such funding. Where such funding has been granted in terms of the strength of the funding agreement, there is a need for a review of the success of such funding firstly in terms of its original undertakings and secondly in terms of sustainability of the project interventions.

The scope of this assignment is focused on providing comprehensive performance overview of the entire project; highlight the lessons learnt so that the conclusions and recommendations arrived at assist the NDA in future projects and also highlight project alignment with municipality IDP and relevant government sectors department's sector departments' programmes. The target audience for the data gathering and evaluation includes (but is not limited to) NDA Development Managers, NDA Provincial Managers, Project Staff and other relevant stakeholders.

The Mmamati Wa Tsie Drop-in Centre is a non-profit organisation which was established in 2005 by the women from the Ga-Selepe Village, Fetakgomo Local Municipality (Sekhukhune District) in Limpopo Province. Mmamati Drop-in Centre was established and registered as an NPO in October 2007 (055-977-NPO Mmamati Wa Tsie Drop-in-Centre). The Drop-in Centre is managed by a retired school principal. The opening of the Drop-in Centre was motivated by the passing away of two of her former students whose children had to be raised by their grandparents in the poor village of Ga-Selepe.

On retirement, she approached the chief from the Ga-Selepe Village for permission to occupy land in order to open this Drop-in Centre. Permission was granted and with the help from the volunteers, she built a shack and started taking care of 113 orphans and vulnerable children in this community. In addition to her financial resources, the USAID donated R11 000 for the procurement of toys. The following governments departments also contributed funds to the Mmamati Drop-in Centre in the past three:

- Limpopo Department of Social Development (DSD)
- Limpopo Department of Education
- Limpopo Department of Agriculture
- Fetakgomo Local Municipality
- Independent Development Trust (IDT)
- National Lottery

The need to incorporate the local Day care Centre was aroused when the Drop-in centre identified the conditions of the local Day Care Centre called Ratanang. Ratanang Crèche was established in 1992 and was taking care of nineteen (19) children of the ages between zero and five. The crèche was operated by one practitioner from a dilapidated one roomed structure with no electricity and no water. The practitioner needed training and the children needed to be accommodated in a safe and hygienic environment. The Mmamati Drop-in Centre took them in and included them as beneficiaries in all their projects.

Funding Received from other third party donors.

**Table 1: Other third Party Funding**

<b>INSTITUTION</b>	<b>AMOUNT</b>	<b>OBJECTIVE</b>	<b>PERIOD</b>
Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP)	R233 513	Create employment for 33 people	2012

Independent Development Trust (IDT)	R884 000	Stipend for 100 volunteers	2012 to 2013
National Lottery	R339 000	Stipends	2013
Department of Agriculture	R570 000	Technical training	2013

### **Project Overall Objective:**

Improve the quality of life for the children in Monametse Village in Fetakgomo Municipality through Early Childhood Development and proper care to vulnerable children.

### **Specific Objectives:**

**Table 2: Current Scope for which Mmamati Drop-in Centre was awarded funding by NDA**

<b>No</b>	<b>SCOPE</b>
1	Establish a quality Day care Centre to cater for crèche/pre-school and drop-in centre
2	To build capacity for 2 practitioners, 2 Cleaners, 6 cooks and 10 members for vegetable production
3	Increase access to early childhood development and aftercare for 0-5 years
4	Provide well balanced meals to the children at the centre on a daily basis.
5	Train 35 project members in vegetable production
6	Create 35 sustainable employment opportunities
7	Register the ECD with the Department of Social Development.

## **2 EVALUATION, AIMS & OBJECTIVES**

The purpose of the investigation was to assess overall success of the program efficacy in terms of the project life cycle under three broad categories which are:

- 1.1** Program Design ( What was planned)
- 1.2** Program Implementation ( What was executed )
- 1.3** Resource Management ( Efficiency of use)

These overarching criteria were undertaken in the context of:

- Relevance: Ability of the project to address the beneficiary's direct needs
- Effectiveness: Were the right interventions undertaken?
- Efficiency: How well were the interventions implemented?

Impact: Did the project have a measurable improvement in the lives of the recipients?

Sustainability: Can the project sustain itself after the NDA funding has stopped?

### **3 EVALUATION METHODOLOGY**

IES adopted a methodology involving interviews, observation (during site visits) review of critical documentation and Fetakgomo Key Population Statistics as issued by Statistics South Africa (StatsSA). Surveys were excluded in this study as the available sample of people was too small to yield statistically significant and reliable data. To further reduce error in the study and minimise ambiguity, the interviews were conducted in Northern Sotho were relevant.

#### **3.1 Documentation and Records**

Internal documents (reports, memos, minutes of meetings, review, etc.) provide a historical account of how a phenomenon has unfolded over time or when the researcher/investigator wants to get an impression of how a program operates without interrupting normal operation. Saunders (1997) lists a number of advantages and disadvantages of reviewing documentary evidence. He points out that the advantages of documentary evidence are that they allow for multiple scenarios and therefore facilitate data triangulation. There are therefore few biases about the information. This works when documentation exists and is available to the researcher. Saunders (1997) also points out that disadvantage of

documentary evidence is that the researcher is limited to the available documents; access may be problematic at times; it cannot be relied on completely to report facts, the researcher also has to be clear about what he is looking for. Document analysis is not flexible. He also points out that the researcher has to be aware of politics in the organisation when using documentary evidence.

Documentation and records were gathered from key stakeholders and were initially studied at IES offices at desktop level.

### **3.2 Observations (Site Visits and validation Interviews)**

An interview involves selecting people to be part of the sample and then interviewing them in person, usually by a trained interviewer, to gather the necessary data. In the interview, the interviewer is able to ask probing, follow up and open ended questions. The interviewer also has the opportunity to clarify questions and misunderstandings as the interview progresses.

#### **3.2.1 NDA Management**

A validation interview was held at the Limpopo NDA Provincial office on the 14<sup>th</sup> of November 2013, with the Project Development Manager, Mrs Carlie Choenyane. The purpose of the interview was to discuss the progress of the Project as formalised in the Agreement Document between NDA and Mmamati was Tsie Drop-in Centre in 2012. Several telephonic discussions were also held with both the Development Manager and project manager for further clarification and document requests.

Most documents were made available by NDA Limpopo office to the IES consultant on the day of visit. However, certain project documents (training records, Mmamati Financial Statements NDA letters approving contract deviations) requested were not immediately available.

### 3.2.2 Mmamati Drop-in Centre Management

On the 14<sup>th</sup> November the IES consultant visited the Mmamati Wa Tsie Drop-in Centre in the Ga-Selepe village. Mrs Mathabatha (Centre Manager) and Mr Mabotha were at the Centre to welcome and host the IES consultant. The visit was on a Thursday morning and this provided an opportunity to witness the daily activities the centre gets involved in.

## 4 RESULTS

Previous section outlined the methodology that IES followed to answer the key questions of the study. This section summarises the results of the investigation. Analysis of these results is left to the next major section of this report.

### 4.1 Documents

The documents gathered from respondents are detailed in Table 3 below. This source of data, while factual, lacked context and justifies the use of other data gathering techniques.

**Table 3: Suppliers of documents and records**

Document Description	Source of Documents and Records			
	NDA Head Office	NDA Limpopo Office	Mmamati	Other
Terms of Reference	X			
Due Diligence Report	X			
Grant Application	X			
Financing Agreement	X			
Project Implementation Report		Received 1 report		
Development Manager Progress Report		X		
Project Files	X	X		
Training Records	X			
Financial Statement			Not available	
Attendance Registers	X			
Fetakgomo Municipality Population Statistics				X

## 4.1.1 Documents and Records Control

### 4.1.1.1 Access to documents

Most Project documents were not immediately available on request due them not being loaded on the NDA Share Drive as soon as they are generated by the responsible stakeholder. This includes among others, training records, contract amendment requests and approvals, interim implementation reports.

## 4.2 Compliance to Contractual Terms

The contract document signed by the NDA and the Recipient is critical as it includes the promises by both parties to deliver on set objectives at agreed time frames. Reasons for any non-compliance to the terms and conditions need to be investigated with the intention of improving performance in future contracts.

The purpose of this section is to measure the extent to which the contract was complied with.

### 4.2.1 Summary show extent of contract compliance

Table 4: Summary of results showing contract compliance (Annexure C)

MEASURE	DEGREE OF COMPLIANCE			
	0	1	2	3
Degree to which NDA mandate met	X			
Financial Management		X		
Degree to which recipient is meeting additional obligations	X			
Procedure for payment		X		
Remedies for non-conformance	X			
Claims against 3 <sup>rd</sup> parties			X	
Cession	X			
Force Majeure			X	
LEGEND : 0 = Non – Compliant 1 = Met to some degree 2 = Met Expectations 3 = Exceeded Expectations				

#### 4.2.2 Interim Implementation Reports

In accordance with the contract, the Project Manager (Mmamati day Care) is obliged to issue the following reports on the following dates:

**Table 5: Project Interim Reports**

<b>Type of Report</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Achieved</b>	<b>Reason</b>
Interim Project Implementation report (Annexure D1 and D2) and Financial reports	31 Jan 2013	Yes (Undated report)	Undated report received.
Interim Project Implementation report (Annexure D1 and D2) and Financial reports	31 May 2013	No	Non-compliance
Final Project Implementation report (Annexure D1 and D2) and Financial reports	30 Sept 2013	No	Project is still not closed out

#### 4.2.3 Financial Statement

Mmamati Financial Statements for 2012 were not made available to the IES team. The request for documents was made to the Mmamati Project team, NDA Limpopo Province and the NDA Head Office without success.

The Due Diligence recommended that Mmamati submit their 2012 Financial Statement as there was a concern with regard to their financial accountability and transparency.

NDA has also not conducted a financial on the project since its inception. This is a real concern as these documents are crucial in the close out evaluation process IES is conducting.

A set of Mmamati bank account statement was provided to the IES consultant

#### **4.2.4 Monitoring Reports**

##### **4.2.4.1 Mid Term Evaluation Report**

The Mid Term evaluation was conducted in March 2013 by one NDA's approved contractors.

The mid-term evaluation did not adequately address the financial accountability and transparency risk as highlighted in the Due Diligence stage. There were no recommendations to assist NDA to follow through on the supply of financial statements from the centre as recommended in the Due Diligence report.

##### **4.2.4.2 DMD Progress reports**

The Development Manager prepared and supplied the IES team one report prepared after her project evaluation on the 16<sup>th</sup> of May 2013.

#### **4.3 Site Visits (Observation and interview):**

The purpose of the visit was to conduct verification at representative sampling level.

The IES consultant visited the site on 14 November 2013 and met with Mrs Mathabatha and Mr Mabotha, the project manager and project co-ordinator respectively.

The following activities were witnessed on the day:

- Morning
  - 1 Ratanang pre-school class in progress (ECD)
  - 1 Ratanang crèche in progress (ECD)
  - Gardening at Mmamati (about 2 volunteers)
  - Construction of the kitchen by the volunteers (about 10 volunteers)
  - Cooking at the Centre
  - Cleaning
- Afternoon
  - Drop-in Centre children arrived (The total number was below 20)
  - Visited the old Ratanang Day Care building (Vacant)
  - Mmamati Manager home garden
  - View vehicle donated to the Project by NDA from another project.
- Tour the Ga-Selepe Village:
  - Visit Churches and school being supported by Mmamati
  - Mine in the Bokoni Platinum Mine
  - Quality of life in the village
  - 3hectare agricultural stand

#### **4.3.1 ECD catering for crèche pre-school and Drop in Centre.**

**Figure 1 : Old Ratanang Crèche**



(Cracks on the old Ratanang Crèche building structure)

**Figure 2 : New Mmamati Drop- in Centre Wendy Housing which also accommodates the Ratanang Crèche**



**Figure 3 : Male and Female Toilets**



Two (2) adult toilets were constructed at the beginning of the year 2013 by the volunteers from the community.

**Figure 4 : Fence installed at the Mmamati Drop in Centre**



Comment:

The objectives were to install fence around the Drop-in Centre and the 3hectare agricultural land. The fence was only installed at the Mmamati Drop-in Centre. This is a deviation to the contract and a financial audit will reveal any misappropriation of NDA funds.

#### **4.3.2 Employment creation**

**Figure 5 : Volunteers busy with the construction of a proper kitchen**



### 4.3.3 Provision of food

Figure 6 : Lunch time at Mmamati Drop in Centre



Figure 7 : Mmamati Small Vegetable Garden



#### **4.3.4 Key Community Challenges**

#### **4.3.4.1 Water Shortage**

According to the Statistics SA for 2011, A third of households (33,1%) of the Sekhukhune (which incorporates the Ga-Selepe Village) had access to piped water on a community stand less than 200 m from their dwelling, followed by 30,2% who have access to piped water in the yard. Only 5,5% of households have access to piped water inside the dwelling, and 11,5% have no access to piped water.

**Figure 8 : Infertile Monametse Village Land**



The Ga-Selepe community informed the IES consultant that there is not enough underground water, as result having a borehole is fruitless. Vegetable gardens are not sustainable and thus the worsening of the poverty in the community. The dependency ratio was at 77.1% in 2011.

#### **4.3.4.2 Geotechnical instability**

**Figure 9 : Cracked Infrastructure due to Geotechnical instability**



The buildings in the village have huge cracks and there is a suspicion that it due to the drilling activities at nearby Bokoni mine.

#### **4.3.5 Responses to evaluation question**

##### **4.3.5.1 Beneficiaries ( Were the correct beneficiaries identified ?)**

The Mmamati Project team believes that the right beneficiaries were clearly defined, chosen and those continue to benefit from the Project.

#### **4.3.5.2 Community Consultation**

Mmamati and the Development Manager confirmed that community consultation process was extensive at the design stages of the project.

The need for Drop-in Centre was identified by Mrs Mathabatha (project manager) after two of her students passed away and left their four (4) children with grandparents in the poor community of Monametse.

The Mmamati team approached the tribal authority and were offered land in order to start a Drop-in Centre. On consultation with the community, the team was offered her backyard to accommodate the children while waiting of construction of the Drop-in Centre.

The continuous collaboration with the community lead to the relocation of the Ratanang Crèche from the old and dilapidated building to the Mmamati Drop-in centre premises.

#### **4.3.5.3 Objectives (Were the objectives clearly defined ?)**

The Mmamati management believe that objectives were not clearly defined as they found it difficult to implement the objectives as set out.

The water shortage and the geotechnical instabilities in the village presented challenges at implementation. Farming activities at the 3 hectare stand were put on hold as the activity is not feasible with limited water supply. The alternative classroom structures Drop-in structure had to be re-investigated and redesigned by the Mmamati management with the assistance of the DM.

The NDA DMD was instrumental in changing of plans and ensuring that the correct measures are taken to make sure that the financial resources are being allocated correctly. However, neither the Development Manager nor the Mmamati Management was able to supply written consent from the NDA for such for contract deviation.

Other deviations implemented were:

- The installation of the borehole had to be abandoned as the local municipality is supplying free water to the Centre.
- The irrigation system was not installed; a hose pipe was used instead.

#### **4.3.5.4 Project Activities and Sequence (Were the activities clearly explained ?)**

Project activity and sequence were clearly explained but was found not to be practical and unachievable at implementation stage. An example is when the plan to building classroom had to be changed to instead buy Wendy Houses and use them as classrooms.

#### **4.3.5.5 Time frames (Were time frames clearly outlined ? )**

The time frames were seen to be clearly outlined but delays happened due to late transfer of funds by the NDA. The Mmamati management claim that the availability of funds further delayed the project by 5 months, thus the inability to achieve all objectives as agreed.

#### **4.3.5.6 Resources (Were the resources adequate and were they prudently managed ? )**

The Mmamati believe that resources allocated by NDA were sufficient for them to complete the project. However, it was noted that the Mmamati had excluded the development of the agricultural land as agreed on the contract. Funds were allocated to install fence, but there was no evidence of such fencing. Mmamati also indicated that they wish to get funding to erect the fence, even though this is one of the objectives of this current contract.

The Mmamati is of the opinion that all resources were prudently managed and all deviations occurred with NDA knowledge and permission.

#### **4.3.5.7 Reporting (Were the reporting clearly outlined ?)**

The Reporting and Monitoring requirement were clearly defined but the Mmamati did not prepare and submit the report as agreed in the contract. The first interim implementation

report, but nothing was received thereafter. Again Mmamati claims that the reports were delayed done on time due to late receipt of fund from the NDA.

Mmamati allowed the NDA appointed evaluators access into their premises and records in order to complete Monitoring Evaluations as required in the contract.

#### **4.3.5.8 Support and Advice (Is the Project receiving support and advice from the NDA ?)**

The Mmamati management is satisfied with the support they continue to receive from the NDA DMD. According to them, she is best suited for the role as she understands the community and gives valuable advice.

Generally, the Mmamati management sees this project as a huge success as the lives of people in the village have been improved in terms of employment creation, food security and ECD.

#### **4.3.6 Achievement of Overall Pre-specified objectives**

Table 6 summarises the achievement/non achievement of specific objectives for this project.

**Table 6: Summary of the achievement of the overall pre-specified objectives**

<b>Pre-specified objectives</b>	<b>Achieved</b>	<b>COMMENT</b>
Establish a quality Day Care Centre to cater for crèche, preschool and drop-in Centre	YES	The objective was met satisfactorily
To build capacity for:	2 Practitioners	NO
	2 Cleaners	NO
	6 cooks	NO
	10 vegetables garden	NO
To increase access to early childhood development and aftercare		The Ratanang crèche is now operating from the premises
Provide balanced meals for the children on a daily basis	YES	The Centre is currently proving food to the children and some community members

<b>Pre-specified objectives</b>	<b>Achieved</b>	<b>COMMENT</b>
To Train 35 project members in vegetable production	Limited Extent	Current garden at the Drop-in Centre can only accommodate a maximum of 5 volunteers.
To 35 create sustainable employment	NO	The IDT is currently funding 100 Mmamati volunteers to do various jobs in the community.
To register the Ratanang Crèche with the Department of Social Development	NO	Still awaiting the department response.

### 4.3.7 Strength and Weaknesses

**Table 7: Strength and Weaknesses**

<b>Strengths</b>	<b>Weaknesses</b>
Free Water – supplied by the municipality Free Electricity – supplied by the local municipality Land was donated Mmamati receives funding from various institutions	Failure to achieve objectives Control of Records Poor Corporative Governance Poor contract compliance Poor asset control Reporting requirements not adhered to Lack of financial transparency (no financial statements issued) Poor enforcement of the contract terms and conditions Lacking organisational capacity

## 4.4 Population Statistics

The key statistics below were published by Statistics South Africa in 2011. These are most recent figures available and it is believed no major changes happened in the Fetakgomo demographics since the statistics were published.

### 4.4.1 Key Statistics for the Fetakgomo Municipality (2011)

**Table 8: Key Statistic of the Fetakgomo Municipality - Statistics South Africa (StatsSA) 2011.**

Total population	93,795
Youth (0-14)	35.4%
Working Age (15-64)	56.5%
Elderly (65+)	8.1%
Dependency Ratio	77.1%
Sex Ratio	82
Population Density	85 persons per km <sup>2</sup>

Unemployment rate	58.9%
Youth Unemployment rate	70.5%
No schooling aged 20+	24.3%
Higher education aged 20+	6.6%
Matric aged 20+	22%
Number of households	22851
Average household size	4.1
Female headed households	55.9%
Formal Dwellings	94.2%
Housing owned/paying off	56.8
Flush toilets connected to sewerage	1.9%
Weekly refuse removal	17.8%
Piped water outside dwelling	5.5%
Electricity for lighting	91.5%

## 5 DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

### 5.1.1 Key Evaluation Issues

Table 9: Planned Project Activities

No	Activity 1 – Preschool Structure and fencing	Achieved	Comments	
1	Fencing the site	YES	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Completed, but the gate was not replaced</li> </ul>	
2	Create employment for 35 project beneficiaries	NO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The IDT funded Mmamati to create employment for 100 unemployed people in the community.</li> </ul>	
3	Register ECD with DSD	NO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Awaiting the Department to respond.</li> </ul>	
4	Procuring Material and constructing the structure	YES	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Toilets were constructed</li> <li>4 Wendy houses were bought (2 used as classrooms for Ratanang Crèche, used as a Drop-in Centre and 1 used as an office)</li> </ul>	
5	Hiring a contractors	NO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Kitchen and toilet were constructed by the locals</li> </ul>	
No	Activity 2 – Capacity Building	Achieved	Comment	
1	Training committee members in	Project Management	NO	Training not provided
		Financial Management	YES	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Treasurer attended a 2 day course.</li> <li>1 Ratanang employee attended</li> </ul>
		Governance	YES	Two non- committee members with the same surname as the manager attended. Mathabatha
		Agricultural Marketing	NO	Training not provided
2	Training teachers and carers	NO	No evidence	
3	Providing Early Childhood Development	YES	Ratanang is housed on the premises	

4	Provide balanced diet for the children	YES	
<b>No</b>	<b>Activity 3 – Vegetable Production</b>	<b>Achieved</b>	<b>Comment</b>
1	Fencing the site 3hectare agricultural land	NO	The land is still without fence
2	Drilling a borehole	NO	Funds redirected towards water tank, water stand, 4 taps, pressure pump and pipes
3	Training project managers in crop production	NO	• Not part of NDA mandate
4	Tillage and irrigation system	NO	• Hose pipe is used instead at the Mmamati Centre garden. No irrigation system was installed at the 3 hectare stand.
5	Planting vegetables and weeding	To some extent	• Small garden in the Drop-in Centre.
6	Harvesting and selling of surplus vegetable	NO	No farming activity has started at the 3hectare stand
<b>No</b>	<b>Activity 4</b>	<b>Achieved</b>	<b>Comment</b>
1	Monitoring and Evaluation	To a limited extent	Mid- term evaluation done Only one interim implementation report was available.
2	Researching of new products	Yes	Moringo medicinal tree. • Brickmaking • Art Products

### 5.1.1.1 Relevance

The project overall objectives were seen to be relevant as they were directly addressing the challenges faced by the community.

The right beneficiaries were chosen by the NDA team. The community of Ga-Selepe in Polokwane is a poor area with low levels of service delivery by the local municipality. It is located near a platinum mine (Bokoni) which does little to uplift the area. The residents in the area are unemployed and rely mainly on the volunteer work created by NGO's in the area.

The community needs in this regard were revealed by the key population statistics published by StatsSA in 2011. The following areas of concern are to be noted:

- Low levels of education

24.3% of people over the age of 20 had no previous schooling experience

6.6% of the community had higher education

Only 22% of the community had matriculated

- High unemployment, especially among the youth  
70.5% of the youth is unemployed  
Overall community unemployment is at 58.9%  
77.1% dependency rate
- Access to clean water and sanitation  
  
1.9% access to flushed toilets  
Only 5.5% water infrastructure in the community

The NDA's intervention in this community is very relevant as their needs are in line with the NDA's primary and secondary objectives.

#### **5.1.1.1.1 Early Childhood Development**

A vast body of research has demonstrated that Early Child Development (ECD) programs benefit children, families, and communities. The reduced dropout and repetition rates, improved school achievements, greater adult productivity, and higher levels of social and emotional functioning encouraged by ECD programs make them a highly cost-effective means of strengthening society as a whole by ensuring that its individual members live up to their full potentials.

The establishment of the Mmamati Drop-in Centre is satisfying a critical need of access to education. The manager has the capacity to effectively manage the Centre due to her extensive experience and passion in educating children in this community.

#### **5.1.1.1.2 Capacity Building**

The training programs designed for this project are relevant but basic and thus will not be able to achieve the NDA's objective of adequately capacitating members of the civil society.

Training is conducted over a three day period and it is believed that this it is too short a period to learn all the concepts and implement them in a one year period.

The appointment of a Mentor to continuously monitor compliance, financial compliance and governance will assist in gradually inculcating the desired culture as these subjects cannot be learned over a three day once off course.

#### **5.1.1.1.3 Vegetable production on 3 hectare stand**

Due to high unemployment, the Drop in Centre needs to sustain itself. However, due to their lack of organisational capacity production at a commercial scale was not achieved.

It is also believed that the Mmamati Project management is incapable of achieving this objective unless they are given appropriate agricultural support by the Department of Agriculture. The interventions needed to make this a success are technical and the management has no capacity to deliver.

It is believed that Mmamati should continue with the current subsistence gardening currently being carried out at the Drop-in premises as it is to provide for food security at the Centre.

Generally, the project design was too ambitious as there were too many objectives to be achieved by a single NPO within a one year period.

Mmamati's core focus should be on ECD and The NDA should continue to assist Mmamati in ECD and ECD related projects as they have proven to have the required qualities to fulfil this and critical need in this community.

Funding for the development of the 3 hectare stand should be discontinued and directed to other Agricultural NPO's in the area.

.

### **5.1.1.2 Effectiveness (Were the right interventions undertaken)**

The project was successful in producing the intended results as far as the Early Childhood Development is concerned. The children in the community now have a safe and appropriate structure to use after school.

The relocation of the Ratanang Pre School to the Drop-in Centre is also an indication that Mmamati management is a community orientated player and looks out for those in need.

The subsistence farming in the Mmamati premises assists in the provision of food for the Drop-in Centre and other community members.

Commercial farming was not seen to be the intervention to be undertaken by Mmamati Drop-in Centre due to their lack of capacity and relevant experience. It is believed that the experience they have is adequate for the current subsistence farming at the Drop in Centre.

The lack of water in the area is posing as a serious challenge to farming, especially commercial farming. Specific technical interventions and experience were required in order to make it a sustainable business.

It is therefore recommended that a separate NPO be funded to focus on the commercial farming. This NPO should be encouraged to align itself with the Limpopo Department of Agriculture as this is there area of speciality.

Access to electricity and clean water has also improved the life of the beneficiaries. The community also has the benefit of using the premises for different community activities.

Employment opportunities created from the NDA interventions is addressing one of the major challenges facing this community. The opportunities include gardening, building, cooking, teaching and administration.

In terms of capacity building, it is believed that the basic training received by the community benefitted the community members. However, for efficient project management, the training will have to be redesigned in order to achieve long term results.

### 5.1.1.3 Efficiency (How well were the interventions implemented ?)

#### 5.1.1.3.1 Compliance with the Contractual Terms (Annexure B)

The contract document is a crucial document in enabling the NDA to achieve its Primary and secondary objectives. It assists all stakeholders in areas of governance, financial management and compliance in the implementation of the agreed objectives. It is therefore very important that this document be devoid of ambiguity and be user-friendly. The literacy level of NDA Fund recipients should be considered when compiling these document as this document must be comprehensible by all stakeholders.

#### 5.1.1.3.2 Degree to which NDA mandate met

The NDA's **Primary mandate** is to contribute towards the eradication of poverty by granting funds to civil society. These funds are in turn used to implement development projects in poor communities and the strengthening of institutional capacity of civil society organisations that provide services in these poor communities.

In this regard, it is believed that the NDA Project has managed to successfully alleviate some of the effects of poverty by means of granting funds to Mmamati Drop in Centre for the objectives as outlined above. The objectives agreed on were found to be in line with the NDA overall objectives which are infrastructure development, food security, early childhood development, employment creation and capacitation.

However, the implementation of some of these primary objectives was found to be lacking on the part of the NDA as the agreed capacitation objectives were not fully achieved. According to the contract the training below was supposed to be achieved, but on 15 November it was discovered that the training plan has not been fully executed by the NDA. This training was supposed to be completed on or before the contract expiry date – 31 August 2013.

**Table 10: Capacity building objectives**

TRAINING	ACHIEVED	
	YES	NO
Project Management		X
Financial Management	X	
Governance	X	

Agriculture and marketing	x	X
---------------------------	---	---

NDA's **Secondary Objective** is to promote consultation dialogue and sharing of development experience between civil society and relevant organs of state.

The Mmamati Project Management have successfully demonstrated a consultative and community driven attitude in the management of the centre.

This was illustrated by the relocation of the local Ratanang crèche to the new Mmamati Drop-in Centre. The crèche were previously operating from an old, dilapidated and unsafe building. The Crèche is currently using two of the 4 Wendy Houses at the Centre. Furthermore, the Wendy classrooms have been equipped with educational material for the children.

The Drop-in centre is also used for community meetings.

The Mmamati management approached the Fetakgomo Local Municipality and the Drop-in Centre is currently being provided with free water and electricity by the municipality.

There are continuous communication with other government department to acquire funding and training to further assist the Monametse community.

Mmamati management have successfully managed to align themselves with other government departments, for example:

- EPWP – Expanded Public Works Programme
- IDT – Independent Development Trust
- National Lottery
- Limpopo Department of Agriculture
- Limpopo Department of Education and Training
- DSD – Department of Social development

#### **5.1.1.3.3 NDA funding objectives**

NDA achieves its objectives by granting funds to the identified civil societies like the Mmamati Drop-in Centre. NDA's funding objectives for the Mmamati Project are as follows:

**Table 11: NDA Funding Objectives**

<b>Objective</b>	<b>Status</b>	<b>Outstanding</b>
Project Funding	Incomplete	R124 712.00
Due Diligence Study	Completed	N/A
Capacity Building	Incomplete	1)Agriculture and marketing and 2)Project management Training
Branding	Completed	N/A

Unfortunately, the NDA did not achieve the objectives within the agreed contract period which ended on 31 August 2013.

The contract commenced on 01 September 2013 but NDA only paid the first tranche was on 27 November 2012, which is almost 3 months after contract start date. It should be noted that most companies/suppliers close their businesses in the first and second week of December for the year end break. This delay has affected the project delivery date as the bulk of the work could only starts in January 2013, which is 5 months into the contract.

Both the NDA and the Project management failed to achieve the objectives agreed on within the agreed contract period of 12 (twelve months) - 01 November 2012 to 31 August 2013 and the contract end date was not extended.

The Project Plan was negatively affected by the late receipt of funds from the NDA.

#### **5.1.1.4 Financial Administration by Mmamati**

The financial reporting dates are as follows:

**Table 12: Reporting Objectives**

<b>Type of Report</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Achieved (Y/N)</b>
Interim Project Implementation and Financial report	31 January 2013	Y
Interim Project Implementation and Financial report	31 May 2013	N
Final Project Implementation and Financial report	30 September 2013	N

Audited Financial Statements	31 December 2012	N (Due Diligence recommendation)
Audited Financial Statements	30 November 2013	N

Mmamati has largely failed to comply with the NDA's financial reporting requirements – **Annexure A, clause 2 - Dates for Report.**

Financial Statements for 2012 were to be supplied by Mmamati as recommended at Due Diligence stage but these were not available at the time of the audit. On requesting these documents, the IES consultant was provided with the bank statements.

The information on the statement is limited as it only shows cash flows and as a result firm opinion cannot be formed. It was however noticed that a number of large cash cheques were issued by Mmamati from their project account. This is major finding and a clear contravention to **clause 3.3.4** of the contract. The contract clearly states that no cash cheque of over R2000 on a once off transaction or R5000 in any one month must be made.

There is therefore a concern that the allocated funding was not spent as prudently as was expected. All outstanding financial reports must be provided to the NDA before any more funds are allocated or paid to Mmamati.

It was also noted that Mmamati is receiving grants from the like the IDT for similar objectives. For example, Mmamati received funding to create employment for 100 volunteers while the NDA has allocated the funds, with the same period, to create employment for 35 volunteers. There is therefore no clear demarcation as there is an overlap on the funding of these objectives.

#### **5.1.1.4.1 Degree to which recipient (Mmamati) is meeting additional obligations**

- **Acting without written consent**

Spending deviations from the contract were observed but there were no NDA Approval records of approval of these deviations.

**Table 13: Contract Deviations**

<b>Type of</b>	<b>Deviated to</b>	<b>NDA</b>	<b>Comment</b>
----------------	--------------------	------------	----------------

<b>deviation</b>		<b>approved</b>	
Borehole costs	Water tank, 1 water stand, 4 taps, pressure pump and pipes.	No records of approval.	It was not needed as the Fetakgomo municipality was providing water
Vehicle	A 4x4 Toyota was allocated to Mmamati from another NDA project.	No records were available	This increased the value of the contract

Although the reasons for the deviations were clear and constructive, there was no prior written consent from NDA available to the IES consultant to verify approval of the deviations. It was revealed in the interviews that discussions were held between the Mmamati Management the NDA Provincial office and the deviations were implemented.

The lack of NDA approval documents is a major finding and calls attention to improvement in governance within the NDA and Mmamati.

**Figure 10 : Vehicle allocated to Mmamati**



#### **5.1.1.4.2 Remedies for non-conformance**

It is evidence to show that the NDA personnel are themselves not complying with the contract and as a result are unable to enforce compliance.

Mmamati has not provided them with the financial Statement for 2012 and there is no evidence of the matter being pursued by the NDA.

The Project team were advised to send written requests to NDA should they wish to deviate from the contract, this was not done and the NDA still did not pursue the matter in order to enforce this expectation.

#### **5.1.1.4.3 Monitoring and Evaluation Reports**

The DM presented one Progress report for the project to the IES consultant. The report received does indeed achieve the objective of informing other stakeholders on the progress of the project. It is, however, believed that reporting should be done on a much more frequent basis. The information collected is for the benefit of the whole organisation with regard to future planning of similar projects. It is therefore critical for the information be comprehensive and complete.

It was also noted that the NDA did not comply with the recommendations in the Due Diligence and the Mid Term Evaluation reports. The Due Diligence report recommended that the Mmamati Project management present financial statements, but there is no evidence that the NDA followed through on this particular recommendation.

Recommendations by service providers should be reviewed and acted in order to improve project management. Failure to do so implies that the process evaluation is ineffective.

#### **5.1.1.4.4 Time Frames**

Time was poorly managed by both the NDA and the Mmamati Project Management team.

The first tranche of the grant was deposited 3 months after the Project start date, i.e., November 2012. This delay affected the contract negatively as the project management.

This further led to failure by the Mmamati to complete the contract on the agreed date, i.e., 31 August 2013.

Interim reports were not submitted to the NDA as required in the contract. To date only one report has been received from Mmamati and two are still outstanding.

Some parts of the project design was found to be impossible to implement and this led to delays as the Mmamati management and the NDA provincial office amended the plan to best fit the conditions. An example is when the team decided to buy Wendy structures and use them as classrooms instead of using the traditional structure made from bricks and cement. This amendment came about because there was evidence of cracked building structures in the community. The cracks are most probably due from the mining activities at the Bakoni Platinum mine in the area.

This delay can also be attributed to inadequate feasibility studies conducted by the appointed service provider. The studies were supposed to reveal all the risk factors with the potential of affecting the cost, time, quality and the scope of the project.

Another challenge for the community is the water shortage. This has a negative impact on the farming activities and the study could have recommended alternative and better farming techniques to be implemented by the project management, e.g., hydroponic farming. A risk management strategy would have gone a long way in saving and ensuring prudent spending of financial resources.

#### **5.1.1.5 Impact**

##### **1. Day care**

The Drop-in Centre has been constructed and is currently being utilised by both Mmamati and the Ratanang Day Care Centre. The Ratanang children have been moved from an old and dilapidated building to a safe structure with access to running water and electricity.

The project has created employment in the community. This employment is however not sustainable as the project is solely depending on grants from different government departments.

##### **2. Provision of balanced and nutritious meals**

Fruits and vegetables benefit children in many ways, including improved nutrition, decreased obesity risk and better school performance

The small garden is instrumental in the provision of balanced and nutritious meals to both the children and the community members.

### **3. Toilets**

Two adults' toilets were constructed, but it is believed that more toilets should be constructed to accommodate everyone all the Drop-in Centre.].

The Drop in centre has benefitted for these toilets as the risk of children falling in the long drop has been avoided. Personal hygiene has also been improved

### **4. Kitchen**

The construction of the kitchen is in progress will assist in hygienic preparation of food and preservation thereof.

#### **5.1.1.6 Sustainability**

The Mmamati Drop-in Centre is not able to generate sufficient income from school fees in order to sustain itself. This is caused by the due to high unemployment. According to StatsSA 2011 Key Population statistics, the unemployment rate in the Fetakgomo is at 56.8%. It was discovered that some of the parents cannot afford to pay school fees on monthly. Mmamati also provide food to some unemployed community members on a continuous basis.

All these factors put a financial strain on the Mmamati Centre's resources and make them eventually unsustainable without third party funding.

Mmamati is fulfilling a fundamental role in this community and should be supported by the NDA and other institutions as there is a low probability that it will be able to sustain itself in the near future.

Three (3) other income generating opportunities were identified by Mmamati to address the challenge of sustainability:

#### **1 Brick Making**

**Figure 11 : Brick making production in progress**



The community started building bricks which Mmamati is currently using to construct the kitchen. This is a potential opportunity for skills development and job creation in this community.

## 2. Moringo Plant

Figure 12 : Moringo Plant



The Mmamati manager has started to grow these plants in her own garden. This plant is believed to have outstanding medicinal properties.

The Mmamati Centre has not started with the production and sale of these trees.

## 3. Art Business

Figure 13 : Side lamp made from egg tray and decorated with beans



Mmamati manager is prepared to train young people to make art products with the intention to sell them.

Introducing Art training programs at the centre can empowering the youth from the community and also create an opportunity to generate income.

### 3. Commercial farming

Farming in Monametse given the status quo is not sustainable. The inadequate supply of underground water is creating major challenges to the farming community. It is therefore recommended that water conserving techniques be investigated.

Hydroponics' gardening is one of the options that can be investigated.

**Figure 14 : Hydroponics gardening**



The system has the following advantages:

- Soil is not required for hydroponics
- No need for huge farming land as it allows the crops to be produced in greenhouses, even in the desert sands. It is a stable technology for growth of plants and ensures high yields
- Water stays in the system thus labour for watering of plants can be avoided
- Lower water costs as water is reused in these systems
- Less water is lost through evaporation and runoff

It should be noted that the start-up cost is high and the projects will need assistance from the organisations like the NDA and the Department of Agriculture.

However, it is still believed that for Mmamati to do farming, they will need to get the appropriate coaching and mentoring as they currently are not capable of meeting this objective.

It is therefore recommended that Commercial farming budget be redirected to a separate agricultural NPO in the community.

### **5.1.2 Generalisation of Results**

Mmamati was not able to meet all the objectives as agreed in the contract. This is attributed mainly to inadequate design by the NDA.

The feasibility study was able to identify the lack of financial transparency on the part of Mmamati but failed to highlight other factors that could negatively impact on the project and its implementation. These factors include, among others, the lack of water resources, the geotechnical instability caused by the mining activities in the area.

This led to inadequate project design which was difficult to implement. The Mmamati management and the NDA DM had to deviate from the contract in order to meet the objectives. Time was also wasted while redesigning the project instead of implementing it its original form.

The lack of documents on request from both the NDA and Mmamati management was common.

Recommendation by independent service providers are not seen to be pursued and implemented by the NDA, e.g., the Mmamati Financial Statements for 2012 as recommended by the Due Diligence. Failure to act on these makes the Evaluations and monitoring a futile and a waste of government resources.

Financial management remains a concern as there is no clear demarcation of funding. This is as a result of Mmamati receiving more than one financial grant for similar objectives.

However, it should be noted that the intended beneficiaries benefitted from the execution of the Mmamati/NDA Project. The quality of the lives for the children in this poverty stricken community has been greatly improved. The centre was able to secure water supply from the Fetakgomo municipality. Water supply in this community is limited and the community depends a lot on the borehole water supplied on Thursdays by the nearby Bokoni Platinum mine.

The Drop in-Centre was also electrified and this makes it easy for them to carry out the Early Childhood Development Programmes. The centre is busy with the construction of the kitchen for which they have employed volunteers. Some of the volunteers are being used to man the small garden at the Mmamati Drop-in centre and others clean the community churches and schools.

It was also noted that no work was done on the 3 hectare Stand as had originally agreed. The Mmamati is hoping that the NDA would in future fund them to start a vegetable garden in order to start generating income. This is a concern as this is one of the unachieved objectives in the current contract. A cost of R70 000 for fencing was observed but not justifiable as small fence was the only fence erected was around the Drop in Centre and the 3 hectare stand remains unfenced.

The Audit cost of R10 000 and there is no evidence that an audit was conducted. A service provider must be appointed by the NDA to conduct an audit on the NDA financial records allocated to Mmamati.

### **5.1.3 Unexpected results and their implications**

The discovery of a Moringo plant in the area was one unexpected result in this Project. The Project management discovered that the Moringo nutritional plant which they believe can be grown and exported to other regions.

#### **1. Brick making**

The community started building bricks which Mmamati is currently using to construct the kitchen. This is a potential opportunity for skills development and job creation in this community.

#### **2. Wood treatment training**

Wendy houses were procured to be used as classes instead of the normal bricks and concrete structures in the village. This route was taken due to the cracking and unsustainable building in the area. The Wendy House supplier provided training to

volunteers on the upkeep and maintenance of these the Wendy houses, including wood treatment. The nature of training will enabled them to construct and maintain sustainable structures for themselves in future.

## 6 RECOMMENDATIONS

IES recommendations are summarised in table below:

Table 14: Recommendations

	Action Required	By who	Objective	When
--	-----------------	--------	-----------	------

	<b>Action Required</b>	<b>By who</b>	<b>Objective</b>	<b>When</b>
1.	NDA to write a letter to Mmamati Drop-in centre requesting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All outstanding interim financial implementation report</li> <li>b. Mmamati audited financial Statements -2012 and 2013</li> </ul>	NDA	Full account of all withdrawals made from the Project account	Immediately
2.	Conduct a full financial and compliance audit (already budgeted for) on Mmamati.	NDA	Accounting for NDA grant	Immediately
3	Withhold outstanding grant funds until an audit is conducted and all reporting requirements are complied with by Mmamati.		Contract Compliance	Immediately
4.	Restrict future Mmamati funding to ECD and ECD related projects.	NDA	Mmamati is experienced in ECD and should focus on improving the ECD interventions.	Future funding
5.	Condemn the old Ratanang crèche building	Mmamati	Eliminate the risk of the building falling and hurting community members	Immediately
6.	Build more toilets at the Centre.	Mmamati	To cater for the number of children at the centre.	Future funding
7.	Conduct a feasibility study on future educations the NDA can implement at the Mmamati Drop-in centre. These could include extra Homework support, Art and drama classes, computer classes and sporting activities.	Mmamati	Invest in the youth education to enable them to have better access	Future Funding
8.	Appoint a separate NPO in the community to focus on Commercial Farming	NDA	Mmamati does not have the organisational capacity to meet this objective.	Future Projects
9.	Enforce Document and Record control measures and compliance to be must be audited at least twice a year	NDA	To avoid loss of documents.	2014 onwards
10	Wood Maintenance Training	Mmamati	Upkeep of the 4 Wendy Houses	Immediately
11	Conduct a workshop on critical contract terms and conditions of the NDA contract	NDA & recipient	Implementation will be easier	Future Projects

## **7 LESSONS LEARNT**

### **7.1 Feasibility studies**

More emphasis should be placed in conducting intensive and comprehensive feasibility studies by appropriately qualified and specialised service providers.

Risk identification by the feasibility study identifies key risks and the necessary mitigation strategies upfront. This will contribute to a more relevant, effective project design which can be executed with ease.

The scope of the due diligence studies conducted by NDA on projects should be extended to include but not limited to the following analysis:

- Geotechnical studies -

Detailed assessment of the soil, feasibility for farming and appropriate building structures to be constructed.

- Water resources

The availability of water poses as a major challenge in the farming communities. It is therefore recommended that water conservation technologies and practices, like hydroponics be investigated.

- Climate assessment

Rainfall extent, reliability of growing season rainfall, temperature, humidity and solar exposure, likelihood and effect of undesirable weather events (drought, floods, heat waves, frost) are some of adverse conditions that affect effective project implementation.

- Infrastructure

Collaboration with NHBRC engineers for advice on appropriate building structure for every environment.

- Proximity to markets

For sustainability purposes, income generating project must have easy access to markets.

It is recommended that NDA link some of the projects with big business development programs, like Pick and Pay. Pick n Pay Enterprise Development Fund was established to enable emerging businesses who would like to explore the possibility of supplying PnP with product or services.

- Detailed assessment of the organisational capacity should be conducted in order to determine deliverable objectives.
- Detailed feasibility study on Early Childhood Development in order to introduce the most effective educational interventions.

## **7.2 Project Mentoring and Coaching**

Continuous support from specialist will assist both the Project managers and the NDA Development Manager to ensure that any deviations are managed in the most efficient while ensuring the sustainability of the project.

It is believed that the training offered to the projects is not always effective due to the low level of literacy in most rural environments. Therefore the availability of a mentor will assist to enforce and improve the understanding of the concept learnt at a practical level.

## **7.3 Control of Documents**

The Project documents and records were not loaded on the NDA Central Share Drive for easy access by all other stakeholders.

It is important for all Projects documents to be immediately and easily available on request as this historical information is of great value to improvement of future Project designs, implementation and management thereof. Project Documents and Records Control

## **8 REFERENCES**

- Due Diligence Report
- NDA SLA Agreement:
- Mmamati was Tsie Project Implementation Report; September 2012 to May 2013
- Mid Term Evaluation Report, 2013
- DM Monitoring Report, Feb 2013
- StatsSA 2011, Fetakgomo Municipality
- Mmamati Bank Statement
- NDA Training records: Governance Training 2013 and Financial Management Training 2013



## 9 ANNEXURES

### Annexure A : Evaluation Questionnaire

Table 15: Project evaluation Questionnaire

#### 1. PROJECT DESIGN STAGE

<i>The following 10 questions are intended to assist us to determine the effectiveness of the MATHS CENTRE Project design.</i>	<b>Interview Results (Mmamati)</b>
1. Were the key PROJECT BENEFICIARIES clearly identified ?	Exceeded Expectation
2. Was there sufficient CONSULTATION with the key beneficiaries ?	Exceeded Expectation
3. Were the Project OBJECTIVES clearly outlined ?	Met Expectation
4. Was each PROJECT ACTIVITY & SEQUENCE clearly explained and practically achievable ?	Met to some degree
5. Was the initial CAPACITY of the recipient organisation taken into consideration in contributing to the achievement of the stated objectives ?	Met Expectation
6. Was the commitment to the agreed TIME FRAMES clearly explained ?	Met expectation
7. Were the Financial, Human and Material RESOURCES appropriately allocated to the project ?	Met to some degree
8. Was the recipient made aware of the REPORTING and MONITORING requirements ?	Met Expectation
9. Was the recipient made aware of the SUPPORT available to them ?	Met Expectation
10. Were the project DELIVERABLES clearly defined ?	Met Expectation

#### 2. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

<i>The following 10 questions are intended to assist us to determine how effective the MATHS CENTRE PROJECT was implemented.</i>	
11. Did the intended BENEFICIARIES benefit from the Project ?	Exceeded Expectation
12. Did the key beneficiaries demonstrate a better UNDERSTANDING of the Project ?	Met Expectation
13. Were the Project Objectives achieved ?	Met Expectation
14. Were the Project ACTIVITIES achieved in the SEQUENCE intended?	Met Expectation
15. Was the recipient organisational CAPACITY initially identified sufficient to achieve the stated objectives ?	Met Expectation
16. Are the agreed TIME FRAMES milestones being achieved ?	Met to some degree
17. Were there any shortcomings in the FINANCIAL, HUMAN or MATERIAL RESOURCES allocated to the Project ?	Met to some degree
18. Were the Project MONITORING and REPORTING milestones achieved ?	Met to some degree
19. Did the Project Management Staff receive ancillary SUPPORT, DIRECTION and ADVICE from the NDA?	Exceeded Expectation
20. Were the Project deliverables met ?	Met Expectation

#### 3.RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

<i>The following 2 questions are intended to assist us to determine if the necessary RESOURCES were allocated and efficiently applied to the MATHS CENTRE PROJECT. Resources means Financial, Human and Material Resources.</i>	
21. Were the allocated resources PRUDENTLY managed ?	Met Expectation
22. Were the resources used according to the AGREED plan ?	Met to some degree

### Annexure B : Mmamati Drop-in Pictures

Figure 15 : New Mmamati Drop in Centre Office (Wendy House)



**Figure 16 : Ratanang Crèche**



**Figure 17 : Mmamati Drop-In Centre**



**Figure 18 : Preparation for Septic tank**



**Figure 19 : Temporary cooking place**



### **Annexure C : Results from Contract Review**

**Table 16: Results detailing the degree to which NDA mandate is met (document review)**

ITEM	KPI	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
		0	1	2	3	

ITEM	KPI	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
		0	1	2	3	
PRIMARY	Strengthen Institutional Capacity		X			Financial Management for CSO and Governance training was provided by NDA approved service providers. Agricultural marketing and Project Management training must still be conducted.
	Implement Development Projects			X		Building the Drop in Centre and vegetable garden
SECONDARY	Promote Consultation dialogue and sharing of development experience between civil society and state organisation			X		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Community based operation. Taking care of children in community;</li> <li>Centre is used as a meeting place by community;</li> <li>Feed the hungry community</li> <li>Afford different volunteers employment opportunities</li> </ul>
FUNDING	R 1 330 740.00 (Inclusive of feasibility study, capacity building and branding)		X			1) The Project funds must still be paid in full. 2) Capacity training is still outstanding
TIME	Start Date : 01 September 2012	X				First tranche paid on 27 November 2012.
	Completion Date : 31 August 2013	X				No Compliance. Project still in progress (November 2013)
	Project Period : 12 Months	X				Has been running for 14 months as at 15 November 2013
	Reports delivered on time	X				No Compliance
<b>LEGEND : 0 = Non – Compliant 1 = Met to some degree 2 = Met Expectations 3 = Exceeded Expectations</b>						

**Table 17: Financial Administration by Recipient**

ITEM	PARTY	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
		0	1	2	3	
Administer the Contribution according to the Generally Accepted Accounting Principles			X			Only 1 report was available on 15 November 2013.
Annual financial Statement 3 months after contract expiry (30 November 2013)		X				Non- Compliance

**Table 18: Results detailing degree to which recipient is meeting additional obligations?**

ITEM	PARTY	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
		0	1	2	3	
ACT WITHOUT WRITTEN CONSENT			X			Cannot be confirmed as deviations records could not be located by IES
Purchase Immovable Property				X		
Disposal of movable or immovable property				X		No evidence of such activity (To be confirmed by Financial audit)
Issue of loans				X		No evidence of such activity
Purchase over R 2000 not budgeted for		X				Evidence of cheques in excess of R300 000 cashed
Postpone or Suspend project				X		
Deviate from approved program and budget		X				Observed deviations not approved by NDA
3 <sup>rd</sup> Party cession		X				No evidence of non-compliance. However, a vehicle allocated by the NDA to the project was not recorded.
Contribute part of grant to third party			X			No evidence of non-compliance. Financial audit report not available on evaluation
Entertainment, Fines, Penalties			X			Financial audit report not available on evaluation
Expenditure prior to commencement date			X			Financial audit report not available on evaluation
DEVIATION IN SPENDING		X				Financial audit report not available on evaluation
WRITTEN NOTIFICATION TO NDA		X				Records missing
BUSINESS CONTRACTUAL OBLIGATIONS			X			
PROJECT END DATE		X				31 August 2013 – Non Compliance
FINAL REPORT AT THE END OF PROJECT		X				No Reports have been received to date
EXCESS FUNDS AT END OF PROJECT PAID TO NDA			X			No excess funds will be available to be refunded to NDA
EMPLOYMENT OF FAMILY		X				Alfred and Moneyi Mathabatha are related to Mrs Mathabatha
LEGEND : 0 = Non – Compliant 1 = Met to some degree 2 = Met Expectations 3 = Exceeded Expectations						

**Table 19: Results Detailing Procedure for Payment Issues**

ITEM	KPI	PARTY	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
			0	1	2	3	
NDA Payment by due date	As per contract Annexure A	NDA		X			50% paid to Recipient November 2012 - Late payment
Notification for Non – Payment		NDA			X		
Contractual Obligations		NDA/Mmamati			X		
LEGEND : 0 = Non – Compliant 1 = Met to some degree 2 = Met Expectations 3 = Exceeded Expectations							

**Table 20: Result Detailing Issues Relating to Remedies for Non-conformance**

ITEM	PARTY	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
		0	1	2	3	
WITHHOLDING OF FUNDS	NDA			X		
FURTHER ACTION TAKEN FOR NON-COMPLIANCE	NDA			X		
LEGEND : 0 = Non – Compliant 1 = Met to some degree 2 = Met Expectations 3 = Exceeded Expectations						

**Table 21: Results Detailing Claims against 3rd Parties**

ITEM	PARTY	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
		0	1	2	3	
CLAIMS AGAINST 3 <sup>RD</sup> PARTY	NDA			X		
LEGEND : 0 = Non – Compliant 1 = Met to some degree 2 = Met Expectations 3 = Exceeded Expectations						

**Table 22: Results detailing Cession issues**

ITEM	PARTY	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
		0	1	2	3	
Ceding, Delegation, Assignment of RIGHTS or OBLIGATIONS with other party	NDA/Mmamati		X			No records of approval for the vehicle transferred to the Mmamati Project
LEGEND : 0 = Non – Compliant 1 = Met to some degree 2 = Met Expectations 3 = Exceeded Expectations						

**Table 23: Results Detailing Force Majeure Issues**

ITEM	PARTY	COMPLIANCE				COMMENTS
		0	1	2	3	
FORCE MAJEURE EVENT	NDA & MCPT			x		
LEGEND : 0 = Non – Compliant 1 = Met to some degree 2 = Met Expectations 3 = Exceeded Expectations						



# NDA

National  
Development  
Agency

## LIMPOPO

Albatross Centre - Suite 8  
19 Market Street  
Polokwane  
0700

Tel: 015 291 2492  
Reception Ext (2201)  
Fax: 015 295 7586  
Email: limpopoprovince@nda.org.za

## KWAZULU NATAL

Suite 1202  
Nedbank Centre  
303 Smith Street  
Durban Club Place  
DURBAN  
4001

Tel: 031 305 5542  
Fax: 031 305 5140  
Email: kznprovince@nda.org.za

## GAUTENG

10<sup>th</sup> Floor, Braamfontein Centre  
23 Jorissen Street  
Braamfontein

Tel: 011 339 6410  
Fax: 011 339 6410  
Email: gautengprovince@nda.org.za

## EASTERN CAPE

The Ridge Building  
Ground Floor,  
3 Berea Terrace  
Berea  
East London  
5214

Tel: 043 721 1226/7  
Fax: 043 721 2096  
Email: ecprovince@nda.org.za

## NORTH WEST

Office 0113A  
First Floor  
West Gallery Megacity  
Mmabatho  
2735

PO Box 6118  
Mmabatho  
2735

Tel: 018 392 6892  
Fax: 018 392 5432  
Email: northwesternprovince@nda.org.za

## WESTERN CAPE

The Chambers Building  
2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
50 Keerom Street  
Cape Town  
8001

Tel: 021 422 5175  
Fax: 021 422 5180 EXT: 2002  
Email: westerncapeprovince@nda.org.za

## FREE STATE

Quantum Building  
Office No 209 - 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
172 Zastron Street  
Bloemfontein  
9300

Postnet Suite 131  
Private Bag X 01  
Brandhof  
9324

Tel: 051 430 2024  
Fax: 051 430 3376  
Email: freestateprovince@nda.org.za

## MPUMALANGA

Ground floor  
Biwater Building Office 103  
16 Branders Street  
Nelspruit  
1200

Tel: 013 755 1478 / 013 755 3777  
Fax: 013 753 2244  
Email:  
mpumalangaprovince@nda.org.za

## NORTHERN CAPE

13 Dalham Road  
Kimberley  
8301

PO BOX 390  
Kimberley  
8300

Tel: 053 831 4828/9  
053 831 4831  
053 832 3365  
Fax: 053 831 4824  
Email: northerncapeprovince@nda.org.za



**NDA**

National  
Development  
Agency

## **NATIONAL HEAD OFFICE**

2<sup>nd</sup> Floor – Grosvenor Corner  
195 Jan Smuts & 7<sup>th</sup> Avenue  
Parktown North  
Johannesburg  
2193

P.O. Box 31959  
Braamfontein  
2017

Tel: (011) 018 5500  
Web: [www.nda.org.za](http://www.nda.org.za)  
Email: [info@nda.org.za](mailto:info@nda.org.za)



**social development**

Department:  
Social Development  
REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA



**NDA**

National  
Development  
Agency



**sassa**

SOUTH AFRICAN SOCIAL SECURITY AGENCY